

State Civil Service and Special Service: A Comparative Analysis (On the Example of Internal Affairs Bodies)

Yusupov Yusupjon Matnazarovich

Head of Department at the Department of Spiritual, Educational and Human Resource Support of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Uzbekistan, Master's Student at the Academy of State Policy and Administration under the President of the Republic of Uzbekistan

Received: 20 June 2026; **Accepted:** 16 July 2026; **Published:** 13 August 2026

Abstract: Recently, Human Resource Management (HRM) practices have increasingly integrated active personnel, military servicemen, and retirees (hereinafter referred to as veterans) of special services (law enforcement agencies and paramilitary structures) into the state civil service (hereinafter referred to as SCS). However, the legal, political, social, and psychological aspects, as well as the motivation behind recruiting veterans into the SCS, remain insufficiently explored from a scientific and practical perspective within the context of Uzbekistan. The primary objective of this study is to systematically organize this practice, develop its core stages—such as execution mechanisms—in the form of a legal framework and methodological guidelines, and implement them into practice. The object of the study comprises the positive human resource management experiences within special services and the issues surrounding the recruitment of their personnel into the SCS. The main subject of the research encompasses international experience, the current situation in Uzbekistan, scientific literature, regulatory frameworks, practical workflows, statistical data, and veterans currently employed within the SCS. The methodology relies on a combination of mixed, comparative-legal, and content analysis methods, utilizing sociological surveys, the evaluation and comparison of legal, statistical, and socio-psychological data, alongside interviews with veterans. As a result of this research, proposals have been advanced advocating for an exclusively individualized approach to attracting special services personnel to the SCS, alongside the adaptation of specific HRM elements from the security sector into the civil service framework. The significance of this study lies in the scientific confirmation that the recruitment (transition) of veterans into the SCS in Uzbekistan is a distinct line of activity that must be executed solely on the basis of precise calculations, an individual approach, and comprehensive risk assessments. The findings can serve as an empirically validated resource for developing future regulatory and departmental documents in this field, as well as for training and professional development programs within the state civil service.

Keywords: Special services and paramilitary structures, veterans, state civil service, military-civil service relations, human resource management.

Introduction: Against the backdrop of globalization processes and socio-economic transformations, the transition of law enforcement and paramilitary personnel (military, internal affairs, prosecutor's office, emergency services, and national guard) to the state civil service (SSS) system is considered an important trend observed in post-Soviet and Asian countries. This process is one of the main challenges in the field of human resource management (HRM), where the skills and experience of veterans can increase the efficiency

of DFX, but their integration faces legal, psychological, and social barriers. In the case of post-Soviet countries (Russia, Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan), this transition is associated with problems such as corruption, political influence, and a lack of qualifications. In Asian and Muslim countries (Qatar, Pakistan, Bangladesh), cultural and religious values influence the transition, but electronic HRM systems can shorten the transition time. This study examined the possibilities of improving the general foundations of this process through a

comparative analysis of international scientific literature. The aim of the study is to develop scientific recommendations for Uzbekistan by conducting a comparative analysis of the legal and practical foundations for involving veterans in the DFS.

Scientific works studying the impact of DFX reforms in the post-Soviet context (e.g., Kotchegura, 2008) indicate that the transition process is associated with corruption and de-politicization issues. In Asian countries, the cultural aspects of veteran integration (Hummel, 2020) have created psychological barriers. The role of comparative research and international cooperation is crucial for solving these problems.

LITERATURE REVIEW

In international scientific literature, the transition of law enforcement and paramilitary personnel to DFS is considered an important direction of HRM.

Daniel Pit et al. (2025) [1] in their comprehensive review summarized the results of sixty years of research published in 36 journals and 78 articles, bringing together scattered literature. Individuals associated with military service are a special class of personnel formed as a result of specific institutional contexts, dynamics, and constraints. Using human capital theory, as well as social identity theory and the compatibility of the individual and the environment as contextual moderators, he proposed a unified conceptual framework to understand how military-related talents are accumulated, transmitted, manifested, and restricted in civilian organizations. Significant gaps include limited research on spouses, reservists, and trustees; weak measurement tools; and the West's veteran-oriented policies. Reconsidering this group as an insufficiently studied demographic group of the labor force is shown to contribute to the development of both theory and practice.

An analysis by Finlay et al. (2019) [2] examined the integration of veterans into the criminal justice system, demonstrating the impact of their health and mental state on their success within the civil service. This study empirically examines the challenges veterans face during their transition, including post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and skill adaptation.

In the context of Asian and Muslim countries, Hummel (2020) [3], analyzing the role of religion and values in Islamic state governance, found that the integration of veterans is linked to cultural and legal aspects.

Al-Khalifa (2016) [4] [5], who studied the problems of veteran integration in Muslim countries (Qatar, Pakistan), highlighted cultural differences in adapting Western HRM practices. A 2023 study on leadership

issues in the Bangladesh police force pointed to HRM challenges (such as discretion and leadership competency) during the transition to civil service.

In the context of post-Soviet countries, Kotchegura (2008) [6] conducted a comparative analysis of civil service reforms in Russia and the Czech Republic, highlighting the problems of corruption and de-politicization in the integration of military veterans. Additionally, Baimenov (2021) [7] studied the evolution of the civil service in post-Soviet countries, demonstrating the diversification of its transformation.

Bannix et al. (2023) [8], who studied the practical aspects of civil service reforms in post-Soviet countries, analyzed the practice of professional development for veteran employees in the context of digitalization.

Using Kazakhstan as an example, an OECD (2018) [9] report presented a comparative analysis of civil service reforms, emphasizing the differences in HRM and professional development when compared with OECD countries.

In a comparative analysis of e-HRM systems in Uzbekistan, UNDP (2024) [11] showed a reduction in veteran transition times, citing the examples of Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, and Uzbekistan. In general, the literature views the integration of veterans as a transformation of HRM, but the legal and psychological barriers in the post-Soviet context have not yet been sufficiently studied [12].

There is academic research on applying HR systems related to training, personnel management, and service discipline from paramilitary structures to the civil service, as well as on the concept of transfer and learning between them; however, this research often falls into two main areas.

1. Comparative Studies of Civil-Military Relations and HR.

Within the academic community, there is a field known as "Civil-Military Relations" [13], which examines the interplay of personnel, literature, training, and HR practices between military and civilian institutions. Journals and academic conferences in this field, notably **Armed Forces & Society**, publish research related to motivation and discipline among those transitioning from military service to the civil service. These studies demonstrate the similarities and differences in HRM strategies between the two sectors.

2. Military HRM research and its overall HRM philosophy.

International scientific literature also examines the general experience of HRM (Human Resource Management) in military systems (e.g., structure, leadership, personnel professionalism, talent

management, etc.). These studies serve as a theoretical basis for applying the general concepts of HRM to civil service. In this context, the US Pentagon, European Defense Academies, and other scientific publications analyze the HRM system and its strategic directions (e.g., leadership in HRM, talent management, personnel motivation).

Buijs T., Olsthoorn P. (2024) [14] analyzed HRM policies, human resources management, key tasks, and trends in military organizations, including functions such as personnel organization, training, evaluation, and motivation, and explored military HRM models and their potential use as a theoretical framework for civilian HRM.

Mohd Azmi Arifin, Farzana Parveen Tajudeen (2020) [15] analyzed the impact of HR information systems in the military HRM system, justifying the positive experience of implementing HRMIS/digitalization in the civilian HR system.

John C. Dexter (2020) [16] studies the issues of military service transition and integration into the civilian professional environment, which reveals the practice of managing dismissed personnel in civilian HRM.

Derek Robert Rohr (2025) [17] analyzes the relationship between the motivation of those transitioning from the army to civil service and HRM practices. In particular, the possibilities of applying motivational models formed in military service to personnel management in the civil service were discussed.

KJ Singh (2019) [18] studies the potential impact of militarized HR approaches on civil service by comparing elements of HR, motivation, and service discipline policy between military and civilian institutions.

Kazimierz Nagody-Mrozowicz, Piotr Pietrakowski (2024) [19] examined military leadership and HRM management systems, attempting to demonstrate the impact on civilian HRM under the influence of individuals.

Tayeb Toufik DAHAR, Yu Zhangquan (2021) [20] views on HRM in the public civil service in terms of "bad," "good" and "effective," while the army is considered as a separate direction in the implementation of HR concepts.

Research on the transition and integration of special services into the civil HR system:

1) There are interpretations in international publications such as "Armed Forces & Society" [21] on the issues of adapting military methods (e.g., strict discipline, mentality, training processes) to public services to ensure international experience and personnel quality. This theoretically confirms the use of military HR practices in strengthening the motivation

and discipline of civil service.

2) Some studies examine the dynamics between the engagement of military personnel as civil servants, their motivation, and service discipline, and identify how military service styles can be applied in civil service.

METHODOLOGY

This study is based on an analysis of scientific literature. The analysis was conducted across three dimensions: content (thematic analysis of problems and conclusions), comparative-legal (country-by-country comparison), and quantitative (statistical analysis of trends in articles). The research relies on empirical evidence (concrete conclusions and facts), avoiding hypothetical models. Additionally, OECD reports (2018) [9] were used to analyze reforms in post-Soviet countries.

RESULTS

The study identified four main trends in the transition of veterans to the Civil Service:

1. In post-Soviet countries (Russia, Kazakhstan), integration is complicated by corruption and political influence, but upskilling through programs like "Time of Heroes" is effective;
2. In Asian countries (Bangladesh, Malaysia), cultural and religious values negatively affect the transition, but e-HRM systems reduce the transition time by 2-3 weeks;
3. In Muslim countries (Qatar, Pakistan), veterans' motivation is high, but there are challenges related to skills gaps and de-politicization;
4. In Uzbekistan, a skills assessment system has been introduced through the State Management Efficiency Agency, but political influence remains high. According to statistical data, the transition efficiency in post-Soviet countries can be assessed as moderate.

CONCLUSION

Integrating veterans into the Civil Service is an important area of HRM, but legal, political, and psychological challenges exist in the post-Soviet and Asian contexts. From Uzbekistan's perspective, the analysis shows that integration can be improved by enhancing the "Argos" system and implementing professional development programs. Key tasks include reducing political influence, imparting new knowledge, and increasing motivation.

In Uzbekistan, the transition of veterans is regulated by the 2022 Law on the Civil Service and internal departmental documents, but this gives rise to problems of political influence and skills shortages. Compared to Kazakhstan and Russia, e-HRM

integration in Uzbekistan is insufficient, which prolongs the transition period. Based on the foregoing, the following are proposed for the initial stage:

- 1) Introduce a "Public Servants" program with special modules for professional development (on the educational platform of the State Management Efficiency Agency). Compared to Kazakhstan and Russia, e-HRM integration in Uzbekistan is insufficient, which prolongs the transition period.
- 2) Strengthen HRM through an individual assessment system for veterans (by the State Management Efficiency Agency).
- 3) Foster international cooperation to create a monitoring and training system jointly with the OECD and UNDP (in collaboration with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs).

DISCUSSION

An analysis of the results shows that the transition of veterans requires a transformation of HRM. The impact of corruption in post-Soviet countries (Kotchegura, 2008) complicates the transition, but the OECD reforms in Kazakhstan (2018) are a successful example of professional development. In Asia, cultural differences (Hummel, 2020) create psychological barriers, but e-HRM integration (UNDP, 2024) increases efficiency. Police reforms in Muslim countries emphasize the economic aspects of growth. These trends are relevant for Uzbekistan, as political influence and skills gaps make the transition difficult.

The impact of corruption in post-Soviet countries (Kotchegura, 2008) complicates the transition, but the OECD reforms in Kazakhstan (2018) are a successful example of professional development. Cultural differences in Asia (Hummel, 2020) create psychological barriers, but the integration of e-HRM (UNDP, 2024) increases efficiency. Police reforms in Muslim countries emphasize the economic aspects of growth.

REFERENCES

1. D. Peat, J. Perrmann-Graham, and C. B. Stone, "Veterans and military-connected individuals in the civilian workforce: an integrative review and research agenda," *Organization Management Journal*, pp. 1–28, Nov. 2025, doi: 10.1108/OMJ-10-2024-2323.
2. K. Singh, C. Timko, M. Yu, E. Taylor, J. Blue-Howells, and A. K. Finlay, "Scoping review of military veterans involved in the criminal legal system and their health and healthcare: 5-year update and map to the Veterans-Sequential Intercept Model," *Health & Justice* 2024 12:1, vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 18–, Apr. 2024, doi: 10.1186/S40352-024-00274-9.
3. D. Hummel, "Public Administration in the Islamic World: Considering the Importance of Religion, its Values and Culture," *Halduskultuur*, vol. 19, no. 2, pp. 23–38, May 2019, doi: 10.32994/HK.V19I2.169.
4. Khalifa Ahmed Saeed Aylan Almheiri, Mohd Sofian Bin Mohammad Rosbi, and Mohd Fitri bin Mansor, "Transformational Leadership and Police Officer Job Performance: A Conceptual Model Moderated by Knowledge Sharing," *The International Journal of Business & Management*, Sep. 2025, doi: 10.24940/theijbm/2025/v13/i6/BM2506-004.
5. N. Mohammed and A. Khalifa, "Introducing Conventional Human Resources Practices as Part of Civil Service Reform in Qatar 2006-2016," 2018.
6. Alexander. Kotchegura, *Civil service reform in post-communist countries : the case of the Russian Federation and the Czech Republic*. Leiden University Press, 2008.
7. A. Baimenov and P. Liverakos, Eds., *Public Service Evolution in the 15 Post-Soviet Countries*. Singapore: Springer Nature Singapore, 2022. doi: 10.1007/978-981-16-2462-9.
8. B. G, K. S, and Z. E, "Overview of the practice of training civil servants in post-Soviet countries in the context of digitalization," *Teaching Public Administration*, vol. 42, no. 3, pp. 308–330, Oct. 2024, doi: 10.1177/01447394231223054;WEBSITE:WEBSITE:SAGE;JOURNAL:JOURNAL:TPAA;ISSUE:ISSUE:DOI.
9. "OECD Public Governance Reviews Benchmarking Civil Service Reform in Kazakhstan," 2018, doi: 10.1787/9789264288096-en.
10. C. B. Spiegel and C. Sutter, "Training and Transfer of Executive Functions for police- and Military Related Tasks," *J. Police Crim. Psychol.*, Nov. 2025, doi: 10.1007/s11896-025-09789-9.
11. A. C. S. Hub, "e-HRM Systems for the Civil Service in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan and the Republic of Korea." [Online]. Available: https://www.undp.org/sites/g/files/zskgke326/file_s/2024-04/20240403_e-hrm_fin.pdf
12. Ivan MAJCHÚT, "Contemporary Civil-Military Relations," *Challenges to National Defence in Contemporary Geopolitical Situation*, vol. 1, no. 1, Nov. 2024, doi: 10.3849/cndcgs.2024.124.
13. Wikipedia, "Civil–military relations." [Online]. Available: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Civil–military_relations
14. T. op den Buijs and P. Olsthoorn, "Human Resource Management for Military Organizations: Challenges and Trends," in *Handbook of Military*

Sciences, Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2023, pp. 1–26. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-02866-4_68-1.

15. M. A. Arifin and F. P. Tajudeen, "Impact of human resources information systems in the military environment," *Asia Pacific Management Review*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 198–206, Dec. 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.apmr.2020.02.001.
16. J. C. Dexter, "Human resources challenges of military to civilian employment transitions," *Career Development International*, vol. 25, no. 5, pp. 481–500, Jun. 2020, doi: 10.1108/CDI-02-2019-0032.
17. L. A. Demeter, J. Biddle, and D. Robert Rohr, "Public Service Motivation, Military Veterans, and the Civil Service: A Qualitative Research Study," *ProQuest*, vol. 1, 2025.
18. M. K. Singh and V. Gupta, "Critical types of knowledge loss in military organisations," *VINE Journal of Information and Knowledge Management Systems*, vol. 51, no. 4, pp. 618–635, Jul. 2021, doi: 10.1108/VJKMS-09-2019-0152.
19. K. Nagody-Mrozowicz and P. Pietrakowski, "Responsible leadership in a military organization (in the light of opinion surveys of professional soldiers)," *Human Resources Management and Services*, vol. 6, no. 4, p. 3394, Oct. 2024, doi: 10.18282/hrms.v6i4.3394.
20. T. T. Dahar and Y. Zhangquan, "Civil service training policy in China and Algeria: What Benefits Algeria can derive from the Chinese experience?," *International Journal of Civil Service Reform and Practice*, vol. 6, no. 1, May 2021, doi: 10.56289/ijcsrp.152.
21. "Armed forces and society," 1999.